

**AN ACT establishing a committee to study New Hampshire teacher shortages and recruitment incentives, and relative to defining secondary school grades for teacher loan forgiveness programs.**

**SB 236, Chapter 150:1, Laws of 2022**

**COMMITTEE TO STUDY NEW HAMPSHIRE TEACHER SHORTAGES AND RECRUITMENT INCENTIVES**

**REGULAR MEETING**

**MEETING DATE:** Thursday, November 3, 2022, at 10:00 AM in SH 100

---

**Start Time:** 10:00 AM

**End Time:** 1:08 PM

**Members Present:** Senator Jay Kahn, Senator Ruth Ward, Representative Rick Ladd, Representative Mel Myler, Director Steve Appleby (NHDOE)

**Members Absent:** Representative Oliver Ford

**Meeting Discussion:**

Senator Kahn opened the meeting at 10:04 AM.

Senator Ward moved the 10/19 minutes and Representative Ladd seconded. Senator Kahn noted a grammatical change on page 13 related to the word “not”. The Committee voted unanimously to adopt the minutes with Representative Ford absent.

Senator Kahn took a poll on availability for the 11/17 meeting. Senator Ward, Director Appleby and Representative Myler are not available to attend. They will circle back.

Representative Ladd noted that he would like to discuss possible recommendations following Director Appleby’s testimony. As there are 16 different clusters and 70 different courses within certification areas/tracks, he would like to do a deep dive.

Senator Kahn introduced Steve Rothenberg for testimony at 10:14 AM.

Mr. Rothenberg introduced himself as a principal for fourteen years which gives him a great idea of how CTE works. He retired this year, however, he is still involved in the community. He has a wide range of expertise.

There are 300 plus CTE teachers, 60 of them are in some form of a site-based licensing plan. One fifth of all teachers have their statement of eligibility and a three-year window to show their competencies.

There are 2,000 students in higher education seeking education in the state whereas 600 get certified. CTE certifications do not typically come from a typical educational route; many come from industry or some form of expertise. They do not show up in those numbers. There are 60 or so teachers working the field in CTE and 20 are getting certified annually.

Senator Kahn asked for clarification on the 60-figure. Mr. Rothenberg said he is using rough figures. He ran a bootcamp for new teachers where they could attend. The cohort was 18.

Senator Kahn asked if that is a consistent number over time. Mr. Rothenberg said yes, average is 20 per year and 60 over time.

Mr. Rothenberg spoke to the nonmovement of students in preprograms. We need to attract people who are not trained as traditional teachers. There is a significant change needed when approaching this industry. Folks coming from trades or contractors will need to be briefed on the unique salary scale that is education. Often times, these folks do not fit into that scale as they won't be paid the same as a teacher of ten years. Onboarding folks in July also needs to be unique to acclimate folks into this industry. Forcing folks to take nine courses is not the way to do it as they are entering this industry. These folks are different kinds of learners, they need an entirely different model. The state has expanded folks window to five years. They have an auto-tech teacher in Concord who got his degree in Ohio, worked for Volkswagen for many years with a long resume. He also had various certifications and was absolutely penalized by the salary scale for teachers. Then, he became one of the top 20 teachers in the country. He had to weather this process where he had to take community college classes with 18-year-old kids. He was running a triple marathon to then get a masters. The intensity that you put into your care and work is what makes folks successful in any industry. NH does not help fund CTE folks to get those additional college credits. The most dangerous thing in education is nostalgia. When teachers don't do training, they fall back to nostalgia of when they were in school. As he was an elementary school teacher, he understands how that happens, but it is dangerous. We need to look at urging folks to leave one career to begin teaching. Early education is a huge void in NH right now. The state needs to jump ahead, significantly, on how viewing these folks when coming successful in this education field. We need to encourage more people to make the jump.

Senator Kahn noted that for every two years of related experience, every CTE educator was given one year on the step scale. Mr. Rothenberg said that is a choice made by school districts, not all, and it is an aspirational model. There are still folks who do 5:1 ratio. One flaw is that auto-tech folks were put on the bachelor's scale. There is no other category to put them in for pay. It is up to the school districts to do this, however, many more districts do engage in this scale matching.

Senator Kahn noted the issue with school board's approving teachers for courses with increased interest. This directly impacts those teachers in their first year. What if there was a legislative initiative for first years in CTE. If you don't make an initial investment, you will never launch. He asked Mr. Rothenberg's thoughts on this strategy to build a greater share of enrollment in CTE.

Mr. Rothenberg clarified: if a teacher wanted to start a new program, the teacher leading this new class would only have one, small cohort of students. The federal government does allow use of federal funds to offset these salaries. Concord does get a pretty good amount in Perkins Loans as they represent 30 towns with high free and reduced lunch numbers. Other school districts with low federal funds would have serious difficulties implementing new programs. It takes time to convince the superintendent, business admin and school board on the science behind the want/need for a course with such minimal students. The course wouldn't be algebra. The rhythm in the CTE world is totally different.

Mr. Rothenberg emphasized the differentiation of a new program versus a new teacher. Delaware is a good example of a state-controlled education.

Representative Ladd noted how CTE is more market driven. High school certifications are needed in specific areas. CTE clusters are huge. His concern is that there is going to be a reverberation on funding by sending districts; based upon students from sending districts, not the course itself. Should we have a process built entirely upon competition and what folks bring forward.

Mr. Rothenberg said the compensation structure for CTE teachers should be different than traditional teachers. Something needs to be created for them separately. The only reward for an auto teacher, financially, is to get a master's degree. These folks normally learn through trainings, not your traditional institutional setting. It is a different mindset and approach.

Representative Ladd asked Mr. Rothenberg about how CTE leadership within each building contributes to teaching methodology.

Mr. Rothenberg said NH has site-based models, plans must be signed off by superintendent and then it goes to the state. There is a lot of latitude to do it, however,

it does depend on leadership at the CTE. He said Director Appleby has done a great job.

Director Appleby asked Mr. Rothenberg about any incentives for folks in specific CTE sectors or businesses.

Mr. Rothenberg said, to his knowledge, there is currently no incentives. One could look at the idea that an incentive could be to not lose your job if you don't do the work to teach such a course. The incentive is the marketplace who could say they need to formally start up a program. The issue in NH is working into concerted efforts to encourage the implementation of programs in certain areas.

Director Appleby noted how CCSNH talks about shortage areas in various industries. He asked how this conversation could be carried into the CTE world and create resources there as well. This would build CTE demand.

Senator Kahn noted that we should keep in mind that our overall salary structure in NH is very low compared to other states. Starting salaries are particularly low. It is a slippery slope to start to guess what districts could and need to pay to incentive folks to work there. Mr. Rothenberg said he is not inciting a pay conversation; he is taking about the missing or lack of a pay scale structure itself for CTE folks.

Representative Myler asked Mr. Rothenberg about the inherent bias towards CTE in comparison to traditional classrooms. He asked if Mr. Rothenberg would agree. Mr. Rothenberg said that is a correct assessment of his testimony.

Representative Myler noted the collect bargaining agreements create salaries for teachers. There are situations where credit can be given for previous experience. That latitude, given to school districts, is inherently biased as it relates to trades people.

Mr. Rothenberg noted that these school districts are attempting to interpret people's background and place it within the existing scale. His experience with kids is that we build structures to establish a vision of education. The salary scale, in its current form, indicates the value we place on these non-traditional educators. Everything needs to be improvised.

Representative Myler asked what that structure should look like. He also asked about certain certifications or criteria being used to grant salary increases.

Mr. Rothenberg said there are two axes: years of service as a teacher and education. A CTE teacher might have years of service in the field as a full-time professional, or as a teacher, or both. As for certifications and criteria being used to grant salary increases, to his knowledge, that is not being used.

Representative Myler asked if it is impossible for local union/management to create CTE compensation format. Mr. Rothenberg said it is possible, however, there is so much bias and CTE people are not a priority. He agreed that there is bias in these institutions.

Representative Myler asked if there needs to be more opportunities for students to engage these opportunities to change the view of CTE. How do we take that movement within the institution and then apply it.

Mr. Rothenberg said his new consulting business does exactly what he is suggesting. There needs to be a rebalancing of systems that respects folks coming from different places. NH is unique that everyone is all in one entity and the CTE voice is muted.

Representative Myler asked if there have been any efforts to meet with collective bargaining folks on this issue.

Mr. Rothenberg said years ago, in Concord, there was a discussion on the pay scale capping out to incentivize getting your master's degree. This year, in the new agreement, they eliminated the bachelor's ten cap. That was the first time in 30 years that we changed the bargaining agreement to create the environment for acceptance of CTE folks.

Senator Kahn said, at the collegiate level, they experience the same problem. However, they came up with ways to resolve this. He asked folks in the audience to follow-up with the Committee about potential efforts to resolve this issue.

Senator Kahn acknowledged Bruce Farr of Wolfeboro to testify.

Mr. Farr introduced himself as a retired principal from Wolfeboro. He was a history teacher and spent his career in CTE. We need to look at this shortage for ALL teachers. There needs to be avenues to encourage folks to teach. He spent fifty years in teaching and would urge the Committee to look at the work done on site-based planning. It is critical and it has been supported by the CTE community. There is a lacking in financial support by the state. If Director Appleby were to move on, there could be a vacuum of knowledge. We need to also keep looking at this pay dilemma. He asked teachers in Wolfeboro what we could do about folks who cap their salary after decades of experience. That is a hardship. If the state could at least take the position to recognize the need for a different CTE pay system, that would be helpful.

Mr. Farr concluded his testimony.

Director Appleby generously offered that Director Karlon present before him on the agenda for the sake of time as it was already 11:00 AM. Senator Kahn acknowledged Director Marty Karlon.

Senator Kahn asked Director Karlon when we could expect survey data. Director Karlon said the week of Thanksgiving might be a good timeline to expect the data, he wants to make sure it is properly audited.

Director Karlon said NHRS retirees can work part-time with participating employers, subject to statutory limits. If folks want to return full-time, retirement benefits will stop until they decide to return to retirement. Part-time employment has a statutory limit. It is a per retiree limit, not a per employer limit. 1,352 hours is the ceiling, that is important to remember. There is a fairly significant penalty if you go over the limit. This is not a frequent occurrence; only one person to go over this limit since 2019. Statute does not define full-time. They have an administrative rule that governs this. For teachers, a teacher shall be employed on a regularly scheduled basis; if not regularly scheduled, they must be employed for a minimum of 18 weeks in a school year and work a minimum of 30 hours or more per week with the same participating employer. Also, they must be in a position where they have an appropriate certification for the department of education. It has to be all three. A retired educator cannot be scheduled to work more than 30 hours a week or they would meet full-time.

Senator Kahn noted that this rule has been in effect for a while with a lot of precedent built up around it. If we assume that folks are full-time, teachers work varied hours and it is hard to quantify the hours they work. He is not sure what to do with the “regular basis” section as that begins to redefine the opportunity to work in the school.

Director Karlon said these were updated sometime in the 1990s. The 18-week limit was implemented to help with substitutes. This provision helps with positions where you need someone but not forever, thus you are not a full-time permanent employee.

Senator Kahn asked if he were to offer a retiree a 30-hour a week position for the school year, would they fit within the rules set forth.

Director Karlon said they would fit into the rules as an active member as it is part time for the year.

Representative Myler asked how we define 30 hours. The quantifications of a part-time person is different for teachers.

Director Karlon noted that schools are different than other NHRS employees. If someone is to spend five hours a day in classroom instruction, that is where that came from. One way to put it is direct contact with students. It is a proximation of contact with students.

Director Appleby asked if a school district wants to hire a retired art teacher to teach one period a day, so ten hours a week, could they do that and would their benefits be

in danger. Director Karlon said that would be acceptable within these rules. Their benefits would not be in danger.

Senator Kahn asked Director Karlon about the best way to interpret this across the state and should we legislate something to make it more consistent. If 30 hours is three quarters time, that would be universally understood.

Director Karlon said the compensation negotiation is not incorporated into the rule. Depending on the terminology, i.e., hours, blocks, periods, etc., their rule looks at if this person being brought in is teaching less than a full-time teacher. If you had two French teachers, teaching in the same timeframes, whereas one is making their pay scale salary and the other is making the same salary PLUS their \$30,000 in retirement, that is where we run into problems.

Senator Kahn asked if retirees working under 30 hours is still permissible. Director Karlon said yes, under 30 hours. Something less than three quarters time.

Senator Kahn asked if the school could be creative with how they schedule teachers in each semester. Director Karlon noted it is important to keep the 18-week period in mind simultaneously with how districts interpret semesters.

Senator Kahn asked if in one, or the first, 18-week period, a teacher can work full-time, however, in the second 18-week period, a teacher is to work part-time, that is permissible under the guidelines. Director Karlon said yes.

Representative Myler asked where the issue of benefits comes in.

Director Karlon said retirees from political subdivisions have a right to stay on the group plan they retired from. You may pay more out-of-pocket than an active employee; employers have gotten away from subsidizing retiree benefits. Employers handle that differently. Under the ACA, anything under 40 hours a week, you are eligible.

Representative Ladd said he is confused. A lot of our teacher shortages relate to special education where their hours aren't based on blocks, periods, etc. They are simply working with kids.

Director Karlon said yes, that could be done as long as they work less than 30 hours.

Senator Kahn reiterated that NHRS looks at this on a case-by-case basis.

Director Karlon said NHRS get "hours worked" data after the fact. They have information available online, but they also have humans on their legal team and audit staff to work with folks. They share the same messaging with retirees.

Senator Kahn asked for clarification about Director Karlon's concern that this kind of arrangement does not eliminate a full-time position that would be a contributing member to the NHRS. He asked if there are unwritten rules where this results in questions by NHRS if folks used this resource year after year.

Director Karlon said there are not written rules. One issue of concern, from their perspective, is the hiring of folks by employers who attempt to avoid paying into the system as they are seeking "part-time" only. Someone has to pay these pensions and it is based on the contributions into the system.

Senator Kahn reiterated how that is the key. One school district may abuse this resource whereas other districts are doing it the right way. Director Karlon concurred.

Director Karlon noted while retirees are being looked at as a resource in this conversation, retirees do not address the recruitment or retention piece of this conversation as they are retired.

Representative Ladd asked if there are other industries, like fire and police, experiencing similar shortage issues. If we were to try and legislate this topic specifically, will others come into the conversation needing similar accommodations.

Director Karlon said he has sat in on conversations where a lacking in staff is an issue for the sectors mentioned. Recruiting classes and the pool of applicants are much smaller. Corrections has had a perpetual staffing problem for 15 plus years. It is possible that other groups would look at this conversation. There is usually an annual attempt by employers/members looking to amend NHRS as they've faced challenges as well.

Senator Kahn noted that the 1,352 hours was assumed to be two thirds time, or 30 hours a week. Director Karlon said, similar to other legislation, that number was a compromise between both chambers. The ceiling of 1,352 is an average of 26 hours a week.

Senator Kahn acknowledged Rachael Blansett, Tina Philibotte and Andres Mejia for their testimony at 11:39 AM.

Senator Kahn asked about the motivation behind each of their school districts in creating their positions and what goals are they expected to achieve.

Ms. Philibotte spoke on behalf of Manchester's School District (MSD) and how this all began with grassroots efforts. She started in 2017. In 2018, Manchester Proud was created and they partnered with MSD to create a strategic plan to address and center



equity. 48% of students are students of color. In 1995, when she graduated from MSD, she was the only Korean student in K-12. Now, MSD is what she wishes it was when she was in school. She did not come back to Manchester until she took this position to create a more inclusive space for children. Kids that look like her deserve to feel like they belong. Had she had someone who looked like her as a child, maybe she would have come back to Manchester sooner. She became an educator to be the person she needed as a child.

Senator Kahn asked about their teaching staff and what percentage are teachers of color. Ms. Philibotte said less than 6% of their 1,600 full-time teaching staff are people of color.

Ms. Blansett noted that there are many school districts in NH that do not believe DEIJ are related or applicable to their school district. In her district, it was a homogeneous looking community until there was a racial reckoning for their community in 2015. Her role is different than Ms. Philibotte's as she works primarily with curriculum and instruction; how can she help teachers to be educated, informed and comfortable to talk about DEIJ in the classroom as students want to ask these important questions. She also assists with their planning.

Mr. Mejia said his position came about as a result of racist incidents in SAU 16 elementary schools. Out of parents coming together, the DEIJ committee was created from parents, admins, etc. Then, other schools started forming their own committees. This was back in 2017/2018. After that, SAU 16 realized they wanted this work on a district level. His role is different than both Ms. Philibotte's and Ms. Blansett's. He works directly with educators. His role supports HR and recruitment retention, reviews policies and oversees the Antidiscrimination Task Force. This role allows for better support for students and admin when these situations arise in schools. He works with their senior leadership team as well. Many of these systems were previously in place without thinking about the perspective of marginalized communities. We should strive to achieve academic excellence so that students can learn without having to focus on their skin color.

Senator Kahn asked if they all have offices in their schools. Mr. Mejia said his office is in the SAU 16 Superintendent's Office. Ms. Philibotte said her office is located in West High School's administrative wing. Ms. Blansett said her office is in the Oyster River Cooperative School District (ORS) building.

Senator Kahn asked if they find that their work is demanded in districts with DEIJ directors.

Ms. Blansett said she has been contacted by parents and districts where DEIJ coordinators don't exist. She can strategically direct folks to attend their school board meetings, etc. She can only do so much without being in their district.

Ms. Philibotte said she probably gets 3-4 calls a week from parents and other admins.

Senator Kahn asked if there is a DEIJ cohort of the 107 SAUs in NH.

Mr. Mejia said he also receives outreach by parents, community members, and especially superintendents. They do not have an official cohort, but they do work together. Concord and Lebanon are working to hire DEIJ folks. As there are no other roles in NH like this, they do reach out to folks in Massachusetts.

Ms. Philibotte and Mr. Mejia have worked to organize a network with folks around the country. While they have each other, they are alone in their districts.

Representative Myler asked about their thoughts on recruitment and retention. He asked what efforts they are doing to attract teachers who are more reflective of their student populations. Also, with the recent passage of the divisive concepts law and the potential reactions by parents/students to content, what impact does that have on retaining teachers.

Ms. Philibotte said those questions are interrelated. The divisive concepts law does not make for a good environment for educators of color to want to become a teacher nor does it encourage educators of color to stay. It is chilling for their roles and teachers of colors. A question is are teachers safe to talk about their lived experiences, or will they lose their job. Another is should I do what is best for students or do I lose my home via losing my job. This law, in her personal opinion, does not make her feel like NH wants her. Right at the time when we began having these very important conversations, this law came through. In terms of retention, the law makes it real hard for all educators to stay in this work and move to this state. As for retention, in Manchester, under 6% of their educators are educators of color and she is thankful for that. Helping to understand the experiences of these educators on the ground right now is important for students to feel connected.

Ms. Blansett said the recruitment piece is easier to navigate than the retention piece, while hard to navigate. Different resources, mentorship programs, financial opportunities, etc. help with recruitment. The retention is more challenging as the culture is not what was promised or expected. One of two admins in her school district are people of color. Their superintendent has been successful in work towards diversifying staff, however, teachers are lacking. While well-intentioned, the space people of color have to navigate is challenging. This work is still being done, they have to be a lot more intentional and deliberate. DEIJ folks are constantly giving but there is not much reciprocation. For teachers coming in, there is a slow burn towards exit. In her district, sometimes educators are not even seeing themselves reflected in their students. Support sometimes does not feel active.

Mr. Mejia said as for recruitment, you have to keep communities in mind, not just the job. For folks coming into NH from more diverse areas, it is difficult to come to NH as representation is also missing from their communities. Educators of color are not only not represented in their schools, they are not represented in their communities. He has said that he only feels included within the confines of his own home with his family. In his experience, if one educator of color leaves, double or triple leave the following year. These folks leave to find communities that support them. Funding and support for affinity spaces is also lacking. Supporting educators through associations, attending conferences, etc. to connect with other folks who are doing this work is important. This reenergizes folks who can be drained emotionally and socially. Educators with disabilities and other marginalized groups also experience this.

Representative Ladd noted the job openings in the ORSD. He did not see vacancies for educators but for support staff. He asked if Ms. Blansett was involved in the onboarding of folks.

Ms. Blansett said not currently. When we think about teacher shortages, ORSD is doing okay. As for diversifying admin roles, it has proved really difficult.

Representative Ladd asked about Ms. Philibotte's involvement in that process.

Ms. Philibotte said all of their roles are the first of their kind in NH. For the food service sector, their lines are long in their lunchrooms. They are looking at thoughtful ways to incorporate culture into the food they serve. There is a lot of excitement about these efforts. These are early conversations. They are looking at NH apprenticeship programs. They are seeing potential to attack the cultural piece, workforce shortage and support their students. In terms of paraprofessionals, she's had conversations with Somerville, MA and Lawrence, MA regarding their parents to paraprofessionals pipeline initiatives for ESL students. They are working with SNHU to engage that conversation. Building partnerships with organizations on the ground is really important as well. BIPOC leaders and connections with folks leads to leads. We should be looking allover, but we should start at home.

Senator Kahn spoke to the grow-your-own pipeline for paraprofessionals.

Ms. Philibotte noted that all three of them are working to examine opportunities for educators of color. They are advocates for students first. Students know they need the tools to advocate for themselves as well. The educators of color being included in these conversations are important as well. She is appreciative that the Committee included them in this conversation.

Mr. Mejia discussed how important it is to bring educators of color, who are now in communities that do not represent them, back to their home communities by paying

for a week to visit family in their home country. These educators need that. For example, a Target employee was paid two whole weeks of vacation to spend with their family in their home country/community. It is always important to remember we are taking about equity, not equality. Providing gas cards for folks to travel is another great idea. Paying folks of color to send them to conferences to learn more is important. He is happy that these conversations are happening. He works with a lot of students in high school. He has had high school senior students break down and cry to him about never having a person that looked like them to vent to. Representation is important. Not having to explain what discrimination they face as the person on the receiving end gets it is huge.

Ms. Blansett echoed the comments of others. She previously worked in higher education. Folks in positions of power have a lot of influence. This is a great first step, however, we need accountability. As someone who has been devoted to equity and teaching for over 10 years, it was important to her that her admin connected her with folks who are invested in the work and showed her how they plan to invest in this work. We need to insulate a culture in these communities. Educational opportunities that are mandated for folks to attend are important as well. If we are not actively trying to build a culture and show we are working towards that, it is not going to incentive educators of color to come into this work.

Senator Kahn asked who was leading the work mentioned in their testimony.

Ms. Philibotte said the work is being driven through folks at the table, people of color and NH Listens through the Carsey School at UNH. There is real opportunity in the work they are doing.

Senator Kahn encouraged them to reach out with any follow-up work they are working on.

Senator Kahn acknowledged Director Appleby for testimony at 12:20 PM.

Director Appleby said the critical shortage survey was issued to school districts roughly five weeks ago. The due date was end of October, however, they only had a 16% response rate so they extended the deadline. Today, they are now at 40% completion. He hopes after Thanksgiving, they will have more data.

Director Appleby said the first data point that was striking was the licensed educator renewal data. There are approximately 28,000 licensed educators statewide, that is from paraprofessionals to superintendents and everything in between. Of this 28,000, approximately 4,000 do not have to renew as they hold a license for life. This license type never expires. Their regular licenses are in three-year renewal cycles. The data presented was broken down in three-year cohorts. This past year, NHDOE saw more renewals than they have over the last 12 years. This was surprising. This doesn't

mean these folks are working in schools. From the standpoint of licensing, they have more renewals this year than in the last decade. They have 105 more licensed educators today than ten years ago. NHDOE has seen a drop in student count during this time period. This drop does not negate the need for teachers in classrooms. There is still a tremendous lag in student count to teachers in classrooms.

Representative Ladd asked about the renewals. He asked if we know how many folks are renewing from out of state and maintaining their licensure in NH.

Director Appleby said it has constantly been at a few thousand, around 2,500. The Legislature's recent background check law will impact these numbers and result in a decline in those numbers.

Senator Kahn asked if these numbers include paraprofessionals. He recalls that number is higher than previous.

Director Appleby said this data does include paraprofessionals. If you look at the length of time of licenses held, which is short, that data indicates the number has increased over the years. Licensure is not required in NH for paraprofessionals, however they may be impacted by federal law.

Senator Kahn asked about the difference in the 2,500 to 4,500 figures. He asked if the jump accounts for some of this steadiness. Director Appleby said it certainly could.

Director Appleby said, several years ago, NHDOE required school nurses to be licensed. Today, they have approximately 475 licensed school nurses, which also contributes to the previous total.

Senator Kahn asked if there are external factors impacting the vacancy rate. He also asked if the influx of dollars to stem learning loss could contribute to more paraprofessionals and more vacancies among paraprofessionals.

Director Appleby said he has not heard of that, but it is certainly possible.

Director Appleby referenced the current critical shortage list based on the administered survey. This survey is written dually by NHDOE and USDOE. USDOE gives NHDOE parameters they want to know about, NHDOE administers the survey and reports it back to USDOE, then USDOE tells NHDOE what the shortage areas are. While this seems a bit backwards, shortage areas determine teacher loan forgiveness by the federal government.

Senator Kahn asked of the 54 survey areas and how many are teaching specific.

Director Appleby said he would have to look at the endorsement list and count them up. He would guesstimate 48-50 teacher endorsements. They have two elementary education endorsements, K6 and K8, and those are historically never on the shortage list. Nationally, those are the two most surplus teaching areas in the country.

Representative Ladd asked about CTE and critical shortage areas. He does not see CTE listed at all in the data.

Director Appleby said this survey is a result of what the districts had reported to NHDOE. Depending on the number of schools who report CTE shortages, it may not be categorized as a statewide shortage.

Director Appleby referenced the next document in his presentation. It covers the new survey questions and how these questions have been changed to be more relevant. This new survey has proven to be much more helpful and inclusive with different endorsement types included. The survey does take more time to complete (about ten times longer) so he is getting a lot of feedback from superintendents on that.

Senator Kahn asked if this survey could be cross examined with the former survey questions.

Director Appleby said not really as they are so different, the previous questions were not helpful.

Representative Ladd asked about certifications for CTE. He also asked if educators can cross over and if this decision should be left up to local school districts.

Director Appleby said you can get a CTE teacher endorsement and also in one of the cluster areas of which you are endorsed. He said CTE educators cannot cross over unless schools use minor Simon rule, which allows for an educator to teach outside of their endorsement area not to exceed half of their work week. This is a whole separate can of worms. Everyday, schools use minor Simon rule to staff their classrooms as they do have local discretion.

Director Appleby said, per statute, local districts can declare a local critical shortage. Superintendents can go before their school board and they take a vote. That means, in practice, a school district can inform the bureau of credentialing which results in a lowered bar to entry. The bar to entry is lower and the bar to exit is the same.

Representative Ladd asked if Salem's school district could declare this kind of critical shortage for their CTE center.

Director Appleby said they could, but that would not address compensation.

Senator Kahn asked about site-based licensing pathways.

Director Appleby said in 2020, there was an administrative rule change. The terminology changed from ALT4 and ALT5 to a site-based licensing plan. They collapsed them into one and the process remains pretty similar. The department has upped their game qualitatively. When a teacher is done with their plan and applying for their license, they should have the same level of knowledge as a graduating college student.

Representative Ladd asked if someone must pass the praxis to be on a site-based licensing plan. Director Appleby said yes, almost all endorsements have to pass that.

Senator Kahn asked if we are keeping track of the total site-based licensing plans.

Director Appleby said yes, they are. The final document in his presentation addresses this. About five years ago, there were about 500 individuals statewide that were on development plans in their first, second and third year. They have seen a decline in graduates in education prep programs. RSA 189:39-a covers information related to local critical shortage declarations. This does not mean you can hire just anybody.

Representative Ladd asked if there are any characteristics associated with these districts that are reporting they need this.

Director Appleby noted that there is no rhyme or reason to it that the department can discern.

Representative Ladd asked if pay has something to do with it in these local districts.

Director Appleby noted that RSA 189:39-b is related to the one-year certificate of eligibility, or emergency authorization as described in the field. This allows districts, as long as an individual in a non-CTE center has a bachelor's degree, passes a background check and deemed qualified by the district, they can hire them for one year only. For CTE, they do not need a bachelor's degree.

Senator Kahn noted that these were questions that came up at the last few meetings.

Director Appleby said as they receive more data from districts, more questions will likely be answered.

Representative Ladd asked if there is a need to extend this resource from one year to three or five years to allow for more time for folks to satisfy their certification requirements.

Director Appleby said he has not heard that from superintendents, the current timeline seems to be working. There are instances where folks cannot pass a test, even folks with a master's degree. For example, the praxis test. Many superintendents are in favor of testing and do not want to lower that bar. Without standardized gauge, it is really hard to know if a person has that competency in that subject area.

Senator Kahn asked Director Appleby about what tests are required. Director Appleby said the praxis core is required and many other areas require the praxis two subject matter test. The state board continues to add to this.

Senator Kahn asked if that needs to be acquired by year one or end of year three for certification.

Director Appleby said yes, praxis core is required prior to entry for year one. Praxis two by the end of the three years.

Senator Kahn said that is a good measure.

Senator Kahn asked about a retiree comes back into the teaching core. He asked what kind of certification they need to go through.

Director Appleby said if the retiree has let their certification expire, NHDOE has no statute of limitations, they just pay a \$50 late fee. If it has been five years or fifteen years, they still need to renew and complete a recent three-year cycles's worth of professional development hours. They want to see 75 hours of professional development in the last three years, for any endorsement. The process is fairly easy. Some states require college classes to come back into the field, NH does not.

Senator Kahn asked what the census date is for this: the point at which they are hired or when they complete that first year. Director Appleby said they need to show professional development information when they apply for license renewal.

Senator Kahn said that seems like a hurdle. Representative Ladd agreed.

Director Appleby said there is no definition of professional development, thus they take many types. From conferences, reading a book, going to trainings, etc. They've been creative with substitutes and the one-year emergency authorization tool is also used. It is a hurdle, but the department has solid ways to assist.

Senator Kahn asked if retirees would have to pay twice on that \$50.

Director Appleby said no, they would not. The department spends a lot of time advising these folks. They also work with superintendents to get these folks on board.



Senator Kahn asked about other cost barriers. Could a desperate school district pay for these kinds of things as opposed to the individual. He wants to confirm that would not influence the process.

Director Appleby said yes, districts can step in and help. Often times, districts will help with professional development. For site-based programs, for example, if a person needs a methods class, districts often pay for that.

Representative Ladd asked about licensed folks in ME, VT, and MA. He asked what the process is for allowing them to work in NH.

Director Appleby said this one is not fun. Folks believe there is reciprocity in NH, however, there is only one state in the country that actually participates in reciprocity and it is not NH. If a ME teacher wants to become a NH teacher, they must meet NH requirements. However, they don't have to do a site-based plan as they have already been a teacher. Experience requirements must be met as well, for example, for superintendents. The department does help folks with work arounds.

Representative Myler asked if the praxis standardized test is a prohibitor when seeking a teaching certification in NH. He raised this question for folks outside of the traditional education realm, i.e. CTE folks.

Director Appleby said, in some cases, there are individuals who cannot pass the praxis. The ETS testing company offers accommodations for folks who need it. They see folks taking the test four or six times within two weeks of their last test. There is free, online training through Kahn Academy, but that takes a few months. They have not seen this impact a large number of folks. There is a rigorous alternative pathway which acknowledges demonstrated competencies. Through an administrative rule change a few years ago, CTE folks can get a waiver for the praxis requirement if they have an industry recognized credential. If folks took the SAT and were above the 50<sup>th</sup> percentile, they can waive it as well. If they took another state exam equivalent, they can waive it that way, too.

Representative Ladd referenced the case of a kindergarten teacher who was upset that she could not get her certification without passing the math praxis.

Director Appleby said he remembers this case. She was an art teacher who had taught in a non-public school setting for many years. She wanted to teach kindergarten art. NHDOE offered her the demonstrated competencies pathway, she did not want to put together a portfolio. They offered the free resources available. He offered to work with the school district. There are individuals who don't pass and NHDOE can only do what they can do.

Senator Kahn noted the NHSAA is working on collecting data. He hopes we can review this data at a subsequent meeting.

Senator Kahn revisited the 11/7 meeting date. The Committee landed on cancelling the 11/17 date and rescheduled to 11/29 at 10:00 AM. Senator Kahn noted that we have not scratched the surface on Pre-K.

Senator Kahn adjourned at 1:08 PM.